

Memo

To: Ashley Kotarba, Heritage Planner, City of Ottawa
From: Carl Bray, Bray Heritage
Date: Friay, September 22, 2023
RE: 321 Dalhousie Street/110 York Street: Revisions to September, 2019 CHIS Addendum

Dear Ashley,

This is in response to your request for an updated heritage impact evaluation for the subject properties. In December 2012, Bray Heritage prepared a Cultural Heritage Impact Statement (CHIS) for the existing hotel building at 325 Dalhousie Street, in accordance with the City of Ottawa's requirements for such heritage impact assessments and submitted as part of the complete planning application for that project. Subsequent to the submission of the CHIS, it was determined that the existing 11 storey building on the property was not able to be salvaged. The building was demolished and the replacement building followed the scale and massing of the previous structure, with a six storey addition to the height. The Andaz hotel is the replacement building currently occupying the property at 325 Dalhousie Street.

Proposed development

Claridge Homes, owner of the subject lands as well as adjacent properties on Dalhousie and George Streets, is now proposing an addition to the existing Andaz hotel located at 325 Dalhousie Street. The addition is to be located on the adjacent parcel to the east located at 110 York Street and requiring access via a portion of the property at 137 George Street. The current development proposal requires a Zoning By-law Amendment in order to permit demolition of the current building at 110 York Street as well as replacement of surface parking in an interior courtyard. Claridge originally submitted plans in 2019 for this addition, with an accompanying addendum from my firm (September, 2019). Since then, they have revised the plans to show a different design for the tower. It is for the revised design that this second addendum has been prepared¹.

As in the previous proposal, the existing building at 110 York Street is proposed to be demolished and replaced with a podium base to the hotel addition. Also as shown in the previous proposal, the podium replicates the massing of the existing building at 110 York Street and provides similar cladding and fenestration. Uses of the podium will be either for commercial (rental) or for additional hotel space. The proposed hotel addition (tower portion) on the 2-storey (10 m.) podium base will be 16 storeys (57 m.) in height and will add 106 new hotel units to the existing hotel.

As shown in the drawings included in the submission package, the proposed addition will have a ground floor podium occupying the entire property at 110 York Street while the upper floors will be set back from York Street (6 m. from the front of the podium). This setback is less than the 10.9 m. setback proposed previously,

¹ For the revised design, please refer to the following drawings prepared by NEUF Architects: Floor plans (June 2023); A100 G Site Plan (May 2023); A401 C North and East Elevations (June 2023); A402 D South and West Elevations (June 2023); and A1100 B Coloured Elevations and Perspectives (July 2023).

a change necessitated by the revised massing and location of the tower portion, itself a response to City requirements for increased setbacks from adjacent towers to the west, on George Street.

For the rest of the the addition, floor plans and renderings show glazing on the south and north (York Street) elevations of the building and a blank wall facing the existing surface parking lot (and future medium density development site) to the east. For the tower portion, this wall is shown as having a large coloured mural on its entire exposed elevation.

Existing conditions

As described in the December, 2012 CHIS, both the existing hotel at 325 Dalhousie Street and the existing building at 110 York Street are located within the Byward Market Heritage Conservation District (HCD,) designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Development within the HCD is regulated by the Byward Market Heritage Conservation District Study (September,1990: Julian Smith & Assoc. et. al.). This study pre-dates the 2005 changes to the *Ontario Heritage Act* and contains elements of what would now be components of an HCD Study and HCD Plan.

Evaluations of properties found within the Byward Market HCD and contained in the HCD Study assess the existing property at 110 York Street as a Category 4 property. This is the lowest category of heritage value and indicates that the property has no heritage significance.

The existing building at 110 York Street was constructed soon after World War II and initially served as office space for the Union St. Joseph du Canada. Later, that organization converted the building to its most recent use as a bar and restaurant. It is a flat-roofed two storey brick and steel structure with concrete floors built to the street line and to the east property line. The 2012 CHIS re-affirmed the HCD Study's assessment of the property as having no heritage significance.

110 York Street abuts 325 Dalhousie Street to the west and has surface parking lots to the south and east. The nearest properties of heritage significance are:

- 126 York Street: 5 storey former warehouse (office with retail at grade) located east of the surface parking lot abutting 110 York Street. As determined in the CHIS prepared for that property by my firm (Bray Heritage, March 2021), the Major warehouse was constructed in 1913 and designed by prominent Ottawa architect C.P. Meredith. It is a reinforced concrete structure with brown brick and metal cladding and ashlar stone detailing. The HCD Study evaluated the property as Category 2, the second highest level of heritage significance. The evaluation of heritage significance in the CHIS confirmed that the building merits designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The warehouse is now being conserved and incorporated into the podium base of a hotel and apartment building being proposed on the property, which extends from York to George Streets.
- 103-127 York Street: 2-3 storey brick house-form and apartment structures on the north side of York Street. These properties were also evaluated in the HCD Study as Category 2.
- 101 York Street: 3 storey brick commercial/residential structure at the northeast corner of Dalhousie and York Street. It was evaluated in the HCD Study as Category 1, the highest level of heritage significance.

The subject property at 110 York Street is also subject to a Heritage Overlay (Section 60 of the City of Ottawa Zoning Bylaw) related to the HCD. The Overlay would require a replacement structure for 110 York Street to match the existing structure's scale, massing, volume, and floor area, on the same location.

Impact of the Proposed Development

The proposed demolition of the existing building at 110 York Street will remove a structure that has been evaluated as having no heritage significance in both the HCD Study and the 2012 CHIS. Accordingly, its removal and replacement with a similar building within a larger structure will not remove a cultural heritage

resource. The replacement structure/podium base responds to the Heritage Overlay conditions by having a similar massing, volume, height, and floor area to the existing building, and by being located on the same site. The brick cladding on the podium base is a similar colour to that of the brick on the warehouse at 126 York Street and continues the use of brick within the HCD portion of the York Street streetscape. The warm brick contrasts with the cooler gray and silver cladding of the hotel and addition, thus distinguishing the pedestrian-scaled elements of the streetscape from the taller towers. The podium's brick cladding also wraps around the corner on the east side of the building, alongside the adjacent surface parking lot. The podium base also has a pedestrian entrance onto York Street, continuing the pattern of street-fronted commercial premises found elsewhere along York Street and in the HCD.

As for visual impact on the heritage character of the HCD, the addition to the hotel will be below the height of the existing hotel. When viewed from the main area of the Byward Market, the addition will be largely hidden behind the existing hotel. The addition will be visible within the HCD in angular views along Dalhousie Street and in facing views along York Street, with the 2-storey podium base in the foreground and the tower portion set back. In general, within the HCD the addition will be seen in the context of a skyline that includes several highrise structures in the properties east of Dalhousie Street. Also, there is a proposal for a 22-storey residential building to be constructed behind the Dalhousie Street buildings, around the corner at 141 George Street. The addition will thus be part of the transition in height and massing from the predominantly low-scale existing development in the main market area to the higher density development area east of the market.

In terms of impact on nearby heritage properties, the proposed addition to the hotel will be lower than the existing hotel in height and will have a smaller massing due to the smaller floorplate and the setback from York Street above the podium level. As a result, its massing will minimize shadow impact on adjacent and nearby properties and permit angular views east along York Street of the heritage building at 126 York Street. There will be no direct impact on the 126 York Street building as the existing surface parking lot will remain, and the proposed addition will also have no windows on the wall facing the existing fenestration on the west side of 126 York Street. Should the existing parking lot between 110 and 126 York Street be developed, the massing of any new building will be a maximum of 6 storeys at York Street, stepping back to a maximum of 9 storeys towards George Street. This massing will provide a transition from the height of the proposed Andaz addition to the 5-storey massing of the heritage building at 126 York Street. The Category 1 and 2 properties across York Street will not be directly impacted and, due to the extra width of York Street east of Dalhousie Street (including a landscaped central median with mature trees), there will be minimal visual impact.

Conclusions and Recommendations

The foregoing report is an addendum to the Bray Heritage report of September, 2019, itself an addendum to the Bray Heritage CHIS prepared in December, 2012 and submitted as part of the original development application for the hotel at 325 Dalhousie Street. The current (second) addendum is intended to accompany the complete planning application for a Zoning By-law Amendment to permit construction of an 18-storey addition to the existing hotel at 325 Dalhousie Street in the Byward Market Heritage Conservation District in downtown Ottawa. The Amendment also requests relief from the provisions of the Heritage Overlay that essentially require like-for-like replacement of existing structures in the District.

The existing building at 110 York has no heritage significance. It was rated as Category 4 (the lowest level, thus no heritage value) in the 1990 HCD Study and the 2012 CHIS re-affirmed this evaluation. As a result, replacement of the existing building will not negatively impact cultural heritage resources in the HCD. Relief from the provisions of the Heritage Overlay is therefore appropriate in this case.

The proposed addition to the existing hotel at 325 Dalhousie Street will have minimal visual impact on the views within the Byward Market HCD and will have no direct impact on properties identified within the HCD Study as having heritage significance. It will have a setback from York Street which will allow angular views of the heritage building at 126 York Street: the setback will also lessen the addition's shadow impact on that property and on Category 1 and 2 heritage properties located on the north side of York Street.

Respectfully submitted,

Carl Bray

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'Carl Bray', written in a cursive style.

Principal
Bray Heritage